Incidence and Duration of Continuously Measured Oxygen Desaturation During Emergency Department Intubation

Jerry B. Bodily, MD; Heather R. Webb, MD; Steve J. Weiss, MD; Darren A. Braude, MD*

*Corresponding Author. E-mail: dbraude@salud.unm.edu.

Study objective: Desaturation during intubation has been associated with serious complications, including dysrhythmias, hemodynamic decompensation, hypoxic brain injury, and cardiac arrest. We seek to determine the incidence and duration of oxygen desaturation during emergency department (ED) rapid sequence intubation.

Methods: This study included adult rapid sequence intubation cases conducted between September 2011 and July 2012 in an urban, academic, Level I trauma center ED. We obtained continuous vital signs with BedMasterEX data acquisition software. Start and completion times of rapid sequence intubation originated from nursing records. We defined oxygen desaturation as (1) cases exhibiting SpO2 reduction to less than 90% if the starting SpO2 was greater than or equal to 90%, or (2) a further reduction in SpO2 in cases in which starting SpO2 was less than 90%. We used multivariable logistic regression to predict oxygen desaturation during rapid sequence intubation.

Results: During the study period, there were 265 rapid sequence intubation cases. The study excluded 99 cases for failure of electronic data acquisition, inadequate documentation, or poor SpO2 waveform during rapid sequence intubation, and excluded cases managed by anesthesia providers, leaving 166 patients in the analysis. After preoxygenation, starting SpO2 was greater than 93% in 124 of 166 cases (75%) and SpO2 was less than 93% in the remaining 46 cases. Oxygen desaturation occurred in 59 patients (35.5%). The median duration of desaturation was 80 seconds (interquartile range 40, 155). Multivariable analysis demonstrated that oxygen desaturation was associated with preintubation SpO2 less than 93% (odds ratio [OR] 5.1; 95% confidence interval (CI) 2.3 to 11.0), multiple intubation attempts (>1 attempt) (OR 3.4; 95% CI 1.4 to 6.1), and rapid sequence intubation duration greater than 3 minutes (OR 2.7; 95% CI 1.2 to 6.1).

Conclusion: In this series, 1 in 3 patients undergoing ED rapid sequence intubation experienced oxygen desaturation for a median duration of 80 seconds. Preintubation saturation less than 93%, multiple intubation attempts, and prolonged intubation time are independently associated with oxygen desaturation. Clinicians should use strategies to prevent oxygen desaturation during ED rapid sequence intubation. [Ann Emerg Med. 2015; - :1-7.]

Please see page XX for the Editor's Capsule Summary of this article.

INTRODUCTION

Background

Rapid sequence intubation is a central technique in emergency department (ED) airway management. An important related adverse event is oxygen desaturation and resultant hypoxemia, which has been associated with dysrhythmias, hemodynamic decompensation, hypoxic brain injury, and cardiac arrest, particularly at saturations below 70%.1-6 Clinical guidelines emphasize the importance of avoiding oxygen desaturation and hypoxemia. Both the EAST Guidelines 2012 and Brain Foundation Guidelines enforce the importance of avoiding hypoxia (SpO2 <90%) in brain injury, pointing to an increase in morbidity and mortality.7,8

Importance

Despite the perceived importance of this adverse event, little is known about the true rates of desaturation during ED rapid sequence intubation. Previous studies of advanced airway management strategies, not all restricted to emergency rapid sequence intubation or emergency physicians, have reported desaturation occurring in 0.2% to 19.2% of cases.9-16 Some of these studies reporting low desaturation rates used definitions that may have underestimated desaturation events. For example, one multicenter study reporting a less than 1% rate of desaturation excluded patients experiencing esophageal intubation.15 Another study from an academic trauma center reporting hypoxemia in only
Editor’s Capsule Summary

What is already known on this topic
Oxygenation desaturation during rapid sequence intubation is potentially harmful.

What question this study addressed
What are the incidence and characteristics of oxygen desaturation during emergency department (ED) rapid sequence intubation?

What this study adds to our knowledge
In this series using a continuous vital sign data acquisition system, oxygen desaturation ($\text{SpO}_2$ decrease < 90%) occurred in 59 of 166 ED rapid sequence intubation cases (35.5%), with a median duration of 80 seconds.

How this is relevant to clinical practice
Clinicians should consider strategies to prevent oxygen desaturation during ED rapid sequence intubation.

MATERIALS AND METHODS
Study Design and Setting
This was an institutional review board–approved, cross-sectional survey of existing airway management practice conducted between September 2011 and July 2012 in the University of New Mexico Hospital Emergency Department, which is an urban Level I trauma center with an Accreditation Council for Graduate Medical Education–approved emergency medicine residency and a total annual volume of approximately 90,000 patients.

Standard airway practice in our ED uses rapid sequence intubation coupled with direct or video laryngoscopy performed in resuscitation or trauma rooms. Preoxygenation is typically performed with a nonrebreather mask set at 15 L/min or greater for several minutes or bag-valve-mask ventilations with supplemental oxygen at 15 L/min or greater when the patient remains hypoxemic despite a nonrebreather mask. During the study period, the use of apneic (passive) nasal oxygenation during the rapid sequence intubation attempt was not common in our ED.\textsuperscript{1,18} Available airway devices included direct laryngoscopy with straight or curved blades and the Storz CMAC video laryngoscope (Karl Storz, El Segundo, CA) with both C and D blades. Attending emergency medicine faculty were present for all rapid sequence intubation attempts and occasionally performed intubations independently when residents were not present or after failed intubation attempts by residents.

Selection of Participants
Using electronic records from the ED automated medication management system (Pyxis MedStation; CareFusion Corp, San Diego, CA), we identified all patients for whom a paralytic medication was dispensed during the study period. We reviewed ED clinical charts and airway quality assurance data collection forms to verify that the paralytic agent was used for rapid sequence intubation. We included all adult (>18 years) medical and trauma patients undergoing rapid sequence intubation by emergency medicine residents or faculty.

We excluded cases in which there was failure of electronic vital sign data acquisition, inadequate nursing or physician documentation of the procedure, or a poor $\text{SpO}_2$ waveform during rapid sequence intubation, as well as those in which anesthesia providers managed the case.

Methods of Measurement
We determined rapid sequence intubation vital signs through a bedside continuous data acquisition system (BMEX data acquisition system; Excel Medical Electronics, Jupiter, FL). This software prospectively records all vital
sign data appearing on bedside cardiac monitors (General Electric Solar 8000i; General Electric Company, Fairfield, CT). We configured BMEX to record continuous waveform data and discrete numeric data on pulse rate, blood pressure, and SpO₂ every 5 seconds.

We used nursing documentation to determine the start and completion times of rapid sequence intubation. We defined rapid sequence intubation start time as the time of paralytic administration and completion time as the time of endotracheal tube placement confirmation, usually by a combination of end tidal CO₂ detection, auscultation, and other clinical indicators of correct tube placement. We extracted physiologic data (continuous pulse rate, oxygen saturation, and blood pressure) from BMEX from 5 minutes before rapid sequence intubation start until 5 minutes after its completion.

We used the medical record to determine the number of intubation attempts, age, sex, intubator and intubator’s level of training, induction agent, paralytic agent, device and technique used, and diagnosis. An intubation “attempt” was defined as a single insertion of the laryngoscope. A single reviewer, trained in abstraction, performed an initial blinded chart review, using a structured abstraction form. A second reviewer, blinded to desaturation events, independently reviewed 25% of cases for agreement on intubation start and stop times. Discordance was resolved by a third reviewer. Because intubation times were continuous variables, we used the intraclass correlation coefficient to assess interrater agreement.

Outcome Measures

The primary outcome was peri-intubation oxygen desaturation. We defined desaturation as a reduction in SpO₂ to less than 90% if the starting SpO₂ was greater than or equal to 90%, or a further reduction in SpO₂ for patients that began below 90%. Preoxygenation SpO₂ was defined as the mean of the SpO₂ values 1 minute before the start of rapid sequence intubation. The SpO₂ nadir during intubation was the lowest SpO₂ value recorded from the time of paralytic administration until tube confirmation.

Primary Data Analysis

Data were imported into and analyzed with Microsoft Excel (version 2013; Microsoft, Redmond, WA) and PASW Statistics for Windows (version 21.0; SPSS, Inc., Chicago, IL). Desaturation data were imported directly into Microsoft Excel, and using intubation start and completion times from the medical record, we calculated the SpO₂ nadir, length of desaturation, and change in SpO₂ during intubation.

We analyzed the data with descriptive statistics, determining the proportion of rapid sequence intubation cases with oxygen desaturation. Medians were compared with a Mann-Whitney U test. To identify optimal cut points for dichotomizing preintubation SpO₂ and intubation time, we constructed a receiver operating characteristic curve, identifying optimal cutoff values with the Youden J index.¹⁹⁻²¹

To identify factors associated with rapid sequence intubation oxygen desaturation, we fit a multivariable logistic regression model with oxygen desaturation as the dependent variable. In developing the multivariable model, we sought to balance conceptually important variables and available statistical power because we anticipated observing only a modest number of events. Therefore, our a priori analytic plan was to include preintubation SpO₂ less than 93%, number of intubation attempts, and intubation time as the primary variables in the model. We also planned to adjust for age and sex. If there were an adequate number of desaturation events (≥60) to maintain a 1:10 ratio of variables to outcomes, we planned to fit a second model with additional adjustment for intubator, training level of the intubator, induction agent, diagnosis, and intubation method. We verified goodness of fit of the model with the Hosmer-Lemeshow test.

RESULTS

Characteristics of Study Subjects

During the 10-month study period, 265 patients underwent rapid sequence intubation in the ED; 99 patients were excluded, leaving 166 cases for analysis (Figure 1). The study group was 73% men, with a median age of 51 years (range 18 to 95 years). Underlying conditions included medical emergencies (sepsis, respiratory cause, altered mental status, etc 62%), neurologic emergencies (cerebrovascular accident and intracranial hemorrhage 17%), trauma (excluding intracranial hemorrhage 18%), and resuscitated cardiac arrest (3%) (Table 1). Table 2 shows that in a univariate analysis for the continuous variables, only age did not show a significant difference between groups.

Main Results

Of the 166 rapid sequence intubation cases included in the study, oxygen desaturation occurred in 59 (35.5%; 95% confidence interval [CI] 26% to 45%). The median oxygen desaturation was 80 seconds (interquartile range [IQR] 40, 155 seconds) (Figure 2). The change in SpO₂ between the start and end of intubation ranged from 15.5 to −58, with a median of −2.2 (−9.9 to −0.1) (Figure 3).
Two investigators independently identified intubation times for 42 of the 166 rapid sequence intubation cases. Interrater agreement was strong (intraclass correlation coefficient = 1.0, exact agreement in 95%).

Among the 166 rapid sequence intubation cases, 124 (75%) were successfully preoxygenated to an SpO2 greater than 93%; for these cases, the median nadir SpO2 during intubation was 95% (IQR 88%, 98%). The remaining 42 cases exhibited start SpO2 less than 93%; the median nadir SpO2 was 84% (IQR 70%, 89%). The percentile rank difference between these medians was 32% (95% CI 23% to 41%).

First-pass success occurred in 75% of rapid sequence intubation attempts; 16% of providers required 2 attempts, 6% required 3 attempts, and 3% required more than 3 intubation attempts. Nadir SpO2 was higher for individuals with first-pass success than those requiring more than 1 attempt; median SpO2 was 93% (IQR 87%, 98%) versus 85% (IQR 71%, 89%), respectively. The percentile rank difference between these medians was 18% (95% CI 8% to 28%).

Of the 3 unsuccessful rapid sequence intubation procedures, rescue airway measures included surgical airway (1 case) and fiber-optic intubation by anesthesia (2 cases). Peri-intubation cardiac arrest occurred in 4 patients (2.4%), with return of spontaneous circulation (ROSC) achieved in all 4 of these patients. Additional complications (eg, oral trauma, aspiration) were not reported.

Receiver operating characteristic curves indicated optimal cutoffs of 93% for dichotomizing SpO2 and 3 minutes for dichotomizing intubation time. On multivariable logistic regression, preintubation SpO2 less than 93%, intubation time greater than 3 minutes, or greater than 1 intubation attempt was independently associated with oxygen desaturation (Table 3). Hosmer-Lemeshow statistic indicated a good fit (P = .91). We did not observe an adequate number of desaturation events to adjust for additional variables in the model.

The series included 31 independent intubators, each managing from 1 to 20 of the cases included in the analysis. There was no evidence of oxygen desaturation clustering within intubators (intracluster correlation = −0.03), and therefore we considered all intubations to be independent.

**LIMITATIONS**

This was a single institutional study, and the results may not generalize to other institutions, depending on practice patterns. Although the vital sign data were prospectively collected, the chart review portion of data collection (intubation start/finish times and number of intubation attempts) was retrospective and therefore subject to reporting bias and data abstraction errors. We minimized this latter effect by following a standardized protocol when
extracting data from the medical record. We also performed a 25% independent review focused on the start and stop times and found exact agreement in 95% of cases.

Practice patterns in our ED at the study indicate that most patients received oxygenation by nonrebreather mask, with greater than or equal to 15 L of oxygen per minute or bag-valve-mask ventilation with supplemental oxygen and did not receive apneic (passive) nasal oxygenation; however, a detailed comparison of preoxygenation methods was not possible from our chart review. Additionally, preoxygenation was defined as the average SpO2 during a minute preceding paralytics; it is possible that this value was lower than the actual value at rapid sequence intubation.

Finally, we were able to analyze only 63% of the possible intubations that occurred during this study period. The majority of excluded intubations (53/99) were due to technical issues, such as server error, that occurred randomly. Inadequate nursing documentation was responsible for 26 of 99 excluded cases, and we suspect this occurred randomly as well. Inadequate SpO2 waveforms resulted in another 17 exclusions; it is possible that some of these were sicker patients with poor peripheral perfusion who were at higher risk for desaturation, thus biasing our results toward less desaturation.

**DISCUSSION**

More accurate knowledge of the true rate of desaturations is critical to understanding patient risk during ED rapid sequence intubation and adjusting methods to avert this risk and its potentially serious complications. In this series, oxygen desaturation occurred in more than 1 of 3 ED rapid sequence intubation cases. Previous studies reported lower incidences of oxygen desaturation during emergency intubation, but with a wide range, from 0.2% to 19.2%. These previous studies used manual recording of self-reported data, which is potentially subject to reporting bias. In contrast, we used electronic data acquisition to obtain continuous physiologic data throughout the entire rapid sequence intubation procedure. The frequency of computer data capture (every 5 seconds) enabled us to identify oxygen desaturation episodes that may have been missed with manual recording. Our experience is similar to that of Dunford et al., who used recording oximeter-capnometers to identify oxygen desaturation and reactive bradycardia during out-of-hospital rapid sequence intubation.

Most textbooks recommend preoxygenation for at least 3 minutes but do not provide a specific physiologic goal. We were unable to achieve preoxygenation SpO2 levels greater than 93% in 25% of rapid sequence intubation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2. Characteristics of the continuous variables, including medians, percentiles of the medians, and 95% CIs.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>No Desat Group</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Median/IQR)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age, y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preintubation SpO2, %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intubation time (median/IQR), min</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. of attempts (median/IQR)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 2.** Duration of desaturation during RSI for patients who experienced desaturation (n=59). Oxygen desaturation was defined as SpO2 less than 90% or reduction from preoxygenation baseline.

**Figure 3.** Change in SpO2 during intubation (n=166).
Table 3. Multivariable analysis for the outcome of desaturation to less than 90%.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>AOR</th>
<th>Lower 95% CI on AOR</th>
<th>Upper 95% CI on AOR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>1.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female sex</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preintubation SpO₂ ≤93%</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>11.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intubation time &gt;3 min</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;1 attempt</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>8.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

AOR: Adjusted odds ratio.

*Model included 5 variables considered for the regression according to 59 desaturation outcomes. Hosmer-Lemeshow goodness-of-fit statistic P = .91.

Pulmonary oxygen reserve is necessary to allow safe apnea time without desaturation. The time to critical desaturation reflects the interplay between oxygen reserve and demand. Although we were unable to control for varying oxygen demand between patients, the inability to elevate saturation above 93% proved to be an independent clinical predictor of desaturation. However, even with preoxygenation to levels above 93%, several patients experienced profound desaturations. In one case, the initial SpO₂ was 100%, yet the patient’s nadir SpO₂ was 42% with a 3-minute intubation procedure time, reinforcing that other factors such as oxygen demand play an important role in determining safe apnea time during rapid sequence intubation.

Expert opinion recommends limiting the number of intubation attempts. Our observations reinforce the importance of first-pass success for patient safety during ED rapid sequence intubation because desaturation was 3 times more likely to occur with multiple intubation attempts. Although Sakles et al. used a 10% decline in SpO₂ to define desaturation, their data showed similar results, with a 9.8% incidence of desaturation with 1 intubation attempt and a 37.8% incidence when more than 1 attempt was needed.

We also found that desaturation was 3 times more likely to occur when intubation procedure times exceed 3 minutes. This observation highlights that the total intubation procedure time is as important as the number of laryngoscopy attempts. While trying to achieve first-pass success, clinicians should not necessarily extend the duration of the attempt.

Our results do not indicate whether the risks of the number or total duration of attempts are mutually exclusive. For example, we do not know whether hypoxemia risk is greater with multiple short attempts versus a single prolonged laryngoscopy attempt.

To our knowledge, there is only 1 outcome study on the risks of desaturation during rapid sequence intubation. This study in severely head-injured patients demonstrated that profound desaturation during rapid sequence intubation resulted in higher mortality. We also know that desaturation contributes to hemodynamic instability and eventually cardiac arrest. Hypoxemia may then act as an important early proxy measure for adverse outcomes during rapid sequence intubation. Until more outcome data are available, achieving and maintaining an SpO₂ as high as possible during ED rapid sequence intubation makes good clinical sense. Strategies that have been demonstrated to improve preoxygenation and prolong safe apnea time include head-up positioning, noninvasive positive-pressure ventilation, apneic nasal oxygenation with regular or high flows, and delayed sequence intubation. Another proposed approach to the hypoxemic patient is rapid sequence airway. Emergency clinicians should consider incorporating all or some of these strategies in their rapid sequence intubation procedures.

In summary, 1 in 3 patients undergoing ED rapid sequence intubation experienced oxygen desaturation for a median duration of 80 seconds. Preintubulation saturation less than 93%, multiple intubation attempts, and prolonged intubation time are independently associated with oxygen desaturation. Clinicians should use strategies to avoid oxygen desaturation during ED rapid sequence intubation.
REFERENCES


